Reviewer's report

Title: Long term hemodialysis aggravates lipolytic activity reduction and VLDL, LDL composition in chronic renal failure patients.

Version: 1 Date: 7 July 2009

Reviewer: Kuan-Yu Hung

Reviewer's report:

Dear Editor:

The manuscript entitled: “Long-term HD aggravates lipolytic activity reduction and VLDL, LDL composition in chronic renal failure patients” had been reviewed in detail. This topic is provoking, however, this work is limited by the study design, patient number and bias within.

Major Comments:

1. This is not a real “prospective” design, but a cohort re-analyzed retrospectively. The details of hemodialysis (HD) therapy, dosage, efficiency are all missing. We need these data to address: if the HD really aggravates or induces these lipoprotein abnormalities?, or this results only from “correlations”? Please supply these data and address this in “Discussion”.

2. We learned from Table 1 and Figures (1 & 2) the VLDL, LDL were changed in different time episodes (T2, T3), which are not consistent with the variations of LPL (T3), HL (T1, T3). Is there any biological rationale to apply?, Can we infer from this observation that LPL is biologically more “dominant” than HL in manipulating lipoproteins of HD patients?

3. Please make it concise of the “methodology” section, as these have largely been standardized.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'