Reviewer's report

Title: No evidence for an association between the -36A>C Phospholamban gene polymorphism and a worst prognosis in Dilated Cardiomyopathy

Version: 1 Date: 4 February 2009

Reviewer: Madhu Khullar

Reviewer's report:

The main objective of this case-control study was to determine the association of the -36A>C polymorphism in PLN gene in a Brazilian population of individuals with dilated cardiomyopathy (DCM) and to test whether this alteration was associated with prognosis of patients with DC. Association of PLN 36A>C genetic variant with DCM has shown contradictory findings in the literature. In the present study, authors have genotyped a relatively large cohort of 885 patients with DC and a 150 control individuals for the association of this variant with DCM. However, there are few important comments/queries related to this work.

Major Compulsory Revisions

1. The cohort of 885 patients is inclusive of patients with diverse etiologies for heart failure and is not specific for DCM patients. Hence, authors need to either change title or give data specific of only DCM patients in this cohort. What was the number of patients with DCM?
2. The no of control subjects is rather small. Was the ethnicity of control and patient population matched?
3. Was there any differences in genotype/allele frequencies between patients and controls using recessive model.
4. What confounders were used to evaluate their results? Were there any alcoholics, smokers or hypertensives?
5. What is the purpose of Table 3? This table should be replaced by another one giving the genotype based response to different drugs.
6. Discussion needs to have some discussion of their own data vis a vis others and reasons for differences from other populations

Minor Essential revisions

There are several typographical and grammatical errors in the manuscript

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published
Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests