Reviewer's report

Title: A search for potential biomarkers of cardiac allograft rejection using expression profiling of human endomyocardial biopsies

Version: 1 Date: 3 April 2006

Reviewer: Luciano Adorini

Reviewer's report:

General
This study searches for potential biomarkers of acute heart rejection. Three candidate biomarkers, identified by expression profiling are analyzed in detail, but none is representative of changes detectable in the serum. Some points in this study should be addressed further:

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)
1. Serum chemokine levels have been determined in 10 patients only. A more extensive analysis could have lead to significant differences. It would be important to extend the number patients tested.

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)
2. It would be more informative to show individual values in Fig. 3A and B.
3. The discussion should address possible reasons for the failure to confirm data published in ref. 16.
4. The lack of correlation with CRP levels could be shown.

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:
'I declare that I have no competing interests'