Reviewer’s report

Title: Comparison of the Epidemiology and Co-morbidities of Heart Failure in the Pediatric and Adult Populations: A Retrospective, Cross-Sectional Study

Version: 1 Date: 16 January 2006

Reviewer: Mark Boucek

Reviewer’s report:

General
A well written manuscript comparing adult and pediatric outcomes of patients admitted with the diagnosis of heart failure. The data were obtained from coded summaries in national databases. It is interesting that the mortality is similar. The authors speculate that it is a serendipitous finding. Perhaps, although the clinical diagnosis of heart failure may have a high risk of death during the hospitalization seemingly unrelated to etiology. Children are more likely to be ventilated mechanically, have congenital heart disease, require procedures, remain hospitalized longer and more likely to require cardiac transplantation during the hospitalization. The authors conclude an obvious need for specialized care/centers for pediatric heart failure. Since transplant is more likely in pediatrics and reflects an equivalent organ outcome(i.e. loss), it may be reasonable to include death and transplant as a combined outcome and then repeat the age comparison.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)
1. references 14 and 25 are the same
2. references 20 and 21 are the same

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

1. combined death + transplant outcome analysis.

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests