Reviewer's report

Title: A Common Genetic Factor Underlies Hypertension and other Cardiovascular Disorders

Version: Date: 20 February 2004

Reviewer: Michael Bjørn Russell

Reviewer's report:

General

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

The original idea for the paper is fine, but the material is not suited for solve the raised question. The four diseases are each complex diseases or more precisely syndromes. Examples are; migraine which exist in two major forms migraine without aura and migraine with aura. Hypertension can be caused by numerous different factors etc. Thus, the background appear too simplified from a genetic epidemiological view. Furthermore cited papers that describe the association between migraine and Raynaud are week. As well as the questionnaire used for migraine diagnosis which was tested in a clinic setting only. Thus, each of the four described diseases has diagnostic uncertainty as well as we know that each of the syndromes has a complex background. For that reason it seems not interesting to test a non-population based twin sample with the MX software and the conclusion that an association of the four syndromes can be explained by a single common genetic factor appears to be an oversimplification.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Reject because scientifically unsound

Level of interest: Too insignificant to warrant publication in any journal

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes