Reviewer's report

Title: Intermittent short ECG recording is more effective than 24-hour Holter ECG in detection of arrhythmias

Version: 1 Date: 2 February 2014

Reviewer: Themistoklis Maounis

Reviewer's report:

Minor Revisions: It should be stressed that the choice of recording method (intermittent recording vs 24-48h recording) is mainly based on the frequency of the episodes. When the episodes are Infrequent it is unlikely that the 24h recording will be of value. In the present study this most important information is found nowhere in the text. It is hidden in the table 1. I wonder about the high number of reported episodes (110 mean). In such a high frequency of episodes I would expect the sensitivity of the 24h recording to be much higher; grossly one out of three recordings should be associated with symptoms. Furthermore how were the patients able to recall accurately this high number of episodes. Did they report number of episodes as a continuous value or categorical (eg 1-5, 5-10,10-50, etc)? I would seriously question the accuracy of the response in the presence of such high number of episodes.

The authors are careful to state that the patients with recorded Afib episodes are "potential" candidates for anticoagulation. Since all the data that we have concerning the value of anticoagulation are derived from studies with clinically documented AFib and not device detected AFib, it should be more clearly mentioned that potentially increased risk for embolic events doesn't automatically translate into proven value of anticoagulation in those patients.

Another limitation of the study is the fact that the high compliance of the patients to obtain intermittent recordings included in this study conducted under a protocol and who were apparently closely followed, might not be reproduced in clinical practice.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests