Reviewer's report

Title: Dotted collar placed around carotid artery induces asymmetric neointimal lesion formation in rabbits without intravascular manipulations

Version: 1 Date: 28 August 2012

Reviewer: Mark Toshner

Reviewer's report:

The authors describe a new variation on an existing animal model to try to better mimic irregular neointimal formation using a collar which stresses the vessel in separate areas. The work is well presented and clearly written though needs some additional data that should not be difficult to provide.

Major compulsory revisions

1) The major issue is that the authors have not given information on how many animals were included in each arm of the experiment. The same goes for when data on vessel is presented. This is throughout and should be corrected prior to acceptance.

2) I have an issue with the lack of the appropriate controls. They authors are contenting an improvement over existing models and ideally they would present control data on one of the existing models. In the absence of this at the very least there should be some histology on unaffected vessels from the same rabbits.

2) The flow data figure should include the mean/ SD measurements in a graphic form (and numbers done).

3) I am not a fan of "data not shown". If the data is mentioned but not significant enough to make it into a manuscript then it can go in a supplemental figure.

4) Both histology figures should be higher resolution.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.