Reviewer’s report

Title: Desflurane Consumption During Automated Closed-Circuit Delivery Is higher Than With a Conventional Anesthesia Machine Used With A Simple Vaporizer-O2-N2O Fresh Gas Flow Sequence.

Version: 1 Date: 12 May 2008

Reviewer: D John Doyle

Reviewer’s report:


This is an interesting study, at least to those (relatively few) individuals who are interested in the detailed workings of modern anesthesia machines. The manuscript is well-organized and well-written, even if it is somewhat tedious by virtue of its highly technical content. There appear to be no readily identifiable flaws in the study.

One aspect of the study that I would ask the authors to consider is to develop a simple model – perhaps in spreadsheet form – that would provide specific cost information for various choices of desflurane cost and other parameters. This would provide readers with a better sense of the cost differences involved. In particular, the authors might provide us with a specific cost example based on their local desflurane cost.

OTHER COMMENTS

1. Is the question posed by the authors well defined? YES
2. Are the methods appropriate and well described? YES
3. Are the data sound? YES
4. Does the manuscript adhere to the relevant standards for reporting and data deposition? YES
5. Are the discussion and conclusions well balanced and adequately supported by the data? YES
6. Are limitations of the work clearly stated? THE MANUSCRIPT WOULD BENEFIT FROM MORE DISCUSSION ON SPECIFIC COSTS TO SHOW HOW IMPORTANT THE ISSUES THEY RAISE ARE.
7. Do the authors clearly acknowledge any work upon which they are building, both published and unpublished? YES
8. Do the title and abstract accurately convey what has been found? YES
9. Is the writing acceptable? YES (Unusually good, in fact)
**Level of interest:** An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests