Reviewer’s report

Title: A Prospective Study To Evaluate The Accuracy Of Pulse Power Analysis To Monitor Cardiac Output In Critically Ill Patients.

Version: 4 Date: 17 October 2007

Reviewer: Nick Linton

Reviewer’s report:

In my opinion, the paper should not be published with the analysis that is illustrated in fig 1 and commented on throughout the paper. This is because it is scientifically unsound, as previously explained. I acknowledge that the vast majority of previous publications in this field have presented an equivalent analysis. However, this error should not be perpetuated further. If the analysis is removed then the current study would, in principle, be acceptable for publication. Instead of figure 1, I would recommend providing separate plots of PulseCO and LiDCO against time, for each patient.