Reviewer’s report

Title: Transversus Abdominis Plane Block or Local Anesthetic Infiltration? A Meta-Analysis of Randomized Controlled Trials

Version: 3
Date: 29 April 2014

Reviewer: Dan Benhamou

Reviewer’s report:

This meta-analysis is interesting, although not providing much novelty. I believe that at least some changes would be necessary before considering acceptance. Although there are relatively few studies in total, one additional analysis would be to evaluate the type of local infiltration. As shown for example by Liu et al (JAMA 2006), local infiltration is a generic word for which there are several techniques. Recently, several authors have shown that preperitoneal infiltration provides a better effect than other sites of infiltration. The authors should try to discriminate these two situations.

It should also be stated that only single shot injections are studied.

Additional questions and comments

Summary

P2, L51: the present study does not compare the two techniques only after lower abdominal surgery? Please rephrase.
P2, L53: the study was not aimed at determining the efficacy of TAP block but to compare its efficacy with that provided by LAI. Please rephrase.
P2, L58-61: details of the statistical study are unnecessary in the abstract section.
P2, L68: sat???

Introduction

P3, L87: Kuppuvelumani et al

P5, L128: abdominal surgery or lower abdominal surgery?
P5, L129: single shot studies

P6, L143 and P6, L150-152: these sentences seem similar. Should they be repeated?
P7, L179: Jadad

Results

P8, L186: VAS scores at 2 hours, not 24h

P9, L215 and L221: was the change significant or was it a trend? If it was significant, only state that and delete the word “trend.”
P10, L239: are summarized
P10, L242: funnel plot is shown
P11, L258: what means handy?
Discussion
P13, L314-316: please delete the last sentence which is out of the scope of the study.

Table 1 and 2 are almost impossible to read. Please change the format.
The readers would be more interested by the Forest plots rather than by the funnel plots and the figures showing methodological issues. Please place as additional files Figures 2, 3 and 4 and place in the paper itself the figures that are presently as supplementary files.

References
Please verify all abbreviations for journal titles and use official and internationally accepted abbreviations