Reviewer’s report

Title: An evaluation of POSSUM and P-POSSUM scoring in predicting post-operative mortality in a level 1 critical care setting

Version: 1  Date: 5 July 2014

Reviewer: Edmund Leung

Reviewer’s report:

The paper is an important topic and well written. The limitations were appropriately discussed. I feel the authors should discuss the caution of using any scoring systems to predict patient outcome, especially if they are to validate S-POSSUM score. There is always a danger of “writing off” patients with a POSSUM prediction. Lots of evidence has shown that no prediction score is perfect and clinicians must judge individual patient clinically. Despite a perfect ROC fit, there will be a good number of patients, who would have a false positively high POSSUM score. Otherwise, it is a very good study.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'