Reviewer's report

Title: Prognosis of AKI in malignant diseases with and without sepsis

Version: 1 Date: 15 September 2013

Reviewer: Noel Gibney

Reviewer's report:

This is a retrospective observational study of outcomes of critically ill patients with AKI in a specialty ICU in a single center.

The question is clearly stated in the abstract but not in the main portion of the manuscript.

It is not clear from the manuscript if the data was extracted from a database, information system or paper files. This should be clarified.

The statement that patients with AKI and cirrhosis of the liver were controls is confusing and not subsequently discussed. Given the small number of such patients, there is little value in having such a “control” group.

Only 212 patients with underlying malignant disease were admitted to ICU. However, the paper largely refers to the total number (1117) of ICU patients.

The data is sound and statistical analysis is appropriate.

The manuscript is poorly written and too long with too many figures. The discussion is excessively long and unfocused. The paper as a whole needs to be shortened by about 25%.

Table 1 needs to include sepsis+AKI. There are too many figures.

The limitations of the work are not clearly stated and should indicate possibly unique patient population in single centre specialty ICU.


The title and abstract accurately convey what has been found.

The writing needs to be significantly improved with elimination of redundant statements as below:

P6-Since the overall patient cohort was heterogenous, patients with septic shock were also defined as septic.

P7 -Mortality means death during treatment at the ICU.
Long discussion of SOFA scores but no SOFA scores in this study-eliminate.

**Level of interest:** An article of limited interest

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests