

Reviewer's report

Title: The Impact of Bone Morphology on the Outcome of the Pivot Shift Test: A Cohort Study

Version: 0 **Date:** 18 Jul 2017

Reviewer: Vehniah Tjong

Reviewer's report:

Very good paper with a few suggestions/clarifications.

- 1) In the discussion section, please give thoughts on the presence/grade of arthritis and how this affects objective findings of pivot shift. Please also add grade of arthritic change in those post-operative knees with arthritis compared to control (contralateral knees).

- 2) When analyzing EAR group alone, does this change the presence of a pivot shift despite anatomic differences? If so, comment on how the presence of an EAR can alter the pivot shift in these patients.

- 3) In comparing males to females, was there a difference seen with FTSR and TPFC ratios?

- 4) Why do you think your study using 2D images found a difference in AP measurements while the previous study you cited which used 3D imaging (Musahl et. al) only found a difference in ML measurements? And how does this change your conclusions if any?

Are the methods appropriate and well described?

If not, please specify what is required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Does the work include the necessary controls?

If not, please specify which controls are required in your comments to the authors.

Unable to assess

Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the data shown?

If not, please explain in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Are you able to assess any statistics in the manuscript or would you recommend an additional statistical review?

If an additional statistical review is recommended, please specify what aspects require further assessment in your comments to the editors.

I am able to assess the statistics

Quality of written English

Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:

Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests

Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?
2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?
3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?
4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?
5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?
6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?

If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

I declare that I have no competing interests

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal