

## **Reviewer's report**

**Title:** Somatic survival and organ donation among brain-dead patients in the state of Qatar

**Version:** 1 **Date:** 27 May 2016

**Reviewer:** Dermot Mckeown

### **Reviewer's report:**

Thank you for clarifying the issues.

It's not a huge point, but full intensive care haemodynamic support would include escalating inotropes/pressors to maintain values, and might result in longer, but futile 'survival'. It might be best expressed as something like:

Withdrawal of care was accepted by one family and for all other patients intensive care was continued including respiratory, hemodynamic, renal, nutritional, and nursing care support provided as discussed with the family.

or

Withdrawal of care was accepted by one family and for all other patients intensive care was continued as discussed with the family.

### **Are the methods appropriate and well described?**

If not, please specify what is required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

### **Does the work include the necessary controls?**

If not, please specify which controls are required in your comments to the authors.

Unable to assess

**Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the data shown?**

If not, please explain in your comments to the authors.

Yes

**Are you able to assess any statistics in the manuscript or would you recommend an additional statistical review?**

If an additional statistical review is recommended, please specify what aspects require further assessment in your comments to the editors.

Not relevant to this manuscript

**Quality of written English**

Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:

Acceptable

**Declaration of competing interests**

Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?
2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?
3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?
4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?
5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?
6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?

If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

I have received air fares, expenses and lecture fees for airway course teaching from Hamad Medical Corporation. This is unrelated directly to the activities described in the report, and I am not aware of having met any of the authors.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal