

## **Reviewer's report**

**Title:** An Anti-Inflammatory Diet as Treatment for Inflammatory Bowel Disease: A Case Series

**Version: 2 Date:** 9 August 2013

**Reviewer:** NAVEEN KAUSHAL

### **Reviewer's report:**

The manuscript by Olendzki et al. addresses one of the most important and desirable aspect towards clinical nutrition for IBD. Considering the fact that IBD patients have suboptimal nutrition and poor absorption, progress in this area holds great potential not only to improve the symptoms of IBD but also to improve the quality of life in patients. However, there are some concerns that need to be addressed for this manuscript to be considered for publication.

#### **Major Comments:**

1. The study needs to be extended with increasing the number of subjects. Currently, only 8 CD (Crohn's disease) patients and 3UC (ulcerative colitis) patients are studied. This lack in number of subjects makes the data statistically non-significant.
2. Furthermore, the subjects should be age-matched for the study. For example: There is a significant variation in the ages of subjects in UC group. While, two subjects are #70 yrs old, one subject is 19 yrs. It is not advisable to take mean age in such cases.
3. Authors have repeatedly made statements about the role of nutrition in maintenance of gut microbiota and its significant in IBD. However, there is no data in this study that supports such statements. To increase the impact of study, data pertaining to changes in microbiome before and after IBD-AID diet consumption should be included and correlated to clinical outcomes.
4. The diet schedules and durations should be clearly indicated. As indicated the patients used the diet for atleast 4 weeks to see symptomatic relief. The authors are suggested to provide the data related to recurrence of the symptoms once the diets were stopped. Alternatively, if the patients are still on these diets how well the diet is tolerated and correlate it to clinical symptoms of IBD.

#### **Minor Comments:**

1. Details regarding the clinical assessment criteria and parameters should be included in the text. The result should be represented in a consolidated table.
2. Finally, there is extensive redundancy in the text. The manuscript needs to be clearly edited for such mistakes.

#### **Discretionary Comments**

1. It should be clarified if the patients were still on medication while consuming these foods? If so, how long they were on these treatments? Furthermore, it

would be interesting to carry on this study in patients under remission. This will help in evaluating the efficacy of IBD-AID diet in maintaining remission as mentioned for Phase III.

Overall, there are some serious drawbacks in the experimental design of the study and it needs major revisions to be considered for publication.

**Quality of written English:** Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

**Statistical review:** Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

'I declare that I have no competing interests'