

Reviewer's report

Title: A 'snip' in time: What is the best age to circumcise?

Version: 1 **Date:** 15 November 2011

Reviewer: gloria pelizzo

Reviewer's report:

Minor Essential Revisions

MC represent up to now in the majority of cases a social, religious problem. Being an indications required by parents in most of the cases, MC has to be supported by defence of children rights. Each national health system has to guarantee this procedure at hospital, in the best conditions of care in order to avoid complications.

Analgesia in infancy has also to be guarantee in preoperative period (to riduce pain) and postoperatively

1 This paper presents a good review on a topic largely debated. I consider the presented argument comes from a consistent assessment and recruitment of opinions from many Center all around the world. Statistic analysis seems to offer an objective view on this topic.

2 This debate address an important overview about a problem having biomedical, social, epidemiologic interest. Cost effectiveness and benefits on public health are also well underlined.

3The paper results to be correctly argued and referenced in all his parts

4 Authors have used logical arguments having social rebounds with perspectives of reconsider this topic in terms of cost -benefits on public health in all Countries

5 The paper is written well for publication under minor essential revisions

a- Infancy represents of sure a window of opportunity for circumcision for parents demanding this procedure . I suggest the authors could underline the low risk of complications when the procedure is conducted at Hospital : so many complications require high costs, long term surgery and follow up when circumcision is rolled out at home for religious reasons especially in infancy

b- Due to the above reported reason I could also ask to the authors underline to proscribe this procedure at home. In this way the publication of this paper could represent an educational resource to encourage MC procedure in infancy

c- It is also important to underline that pain in infancy has to be taken in high consideration. Local anesthesia has to be associated to pre and postoperative analgesia in order to guarantee the pain control even though neonates seems to exhibit lower pain scores than reported in adults. The concept that no credible studies have been conducted about long term memory of pain experienced in infancy has to be noticed in this report in order to assure a treatment for pain control in infants during MC procedure.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.