## 1.1.1 Placebo

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Study or Subgroup</th>
<th>Mean Difference</th>
<th>SE</th>
<th>Weight</th>
<th>Mean Difference IV, Random, 95% CI</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Brusasco 2003</td>
<td>-0.42</td>
<td>0.0935</td>
<td>14.5%</td>
<td>-0.42 [-0.60, -0.24]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Casaburi 2002</td>
<td>-0.19</td>
<td>0.0464</td>
<td>17.6%</td>
<td>-0.19 [-0.28, -0.10]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chan 2007</td>
<td>-0.04</td>
<td>0.0363</td>
<td>18.2%</td>
<td>-0.04 [-0.11, 0.03]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Niewoehner 2005</td>
<td>-0.2</td>
<td>0.0463</td>
<td>17.6%</td>
<td>-0.20 [-0.29, -0.11]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Powrie 2007</td>
<td>-1.29</td>
<td>0.1739</td>
<td>9.2%</td>
<td>-1.29 [-1.63, -0.95]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tashkin 2008</td>
<td>-0.12</td>
<td>0.0306</td>
<td>18.4%</td>
<td>-0.12 [-0.18, -0.06]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tonnel 2008</td>
<td>-0.77</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>4.5%</td>
<td>-0.77 [-1.36, -0.18]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Subtotal (95% CI) 100.0% -0.31 [-0.46, -0.17]

Heterogeneity: Tau² = 0.03, Chi² = 87.90, df = 6 (P < 0.00001), I² = 91%
Test for overall effect: Z = 4.26 (P < 0.0001)

## 1.1.2 Ipratropium

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Study or Subgroup</th>
<th>Mean Difference</th>
<th>SE</th>
<th>Weight</th>
<th>Mean Difference IV, Random, 95% CI</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Vincken 2002</td>
<td>-0.23</td>
<td>0.0393</td>
<td>100.0%</td>
<td>-0.23 [-0.31, -0.15]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Subtotal (95% CI) 100.0% -0.23 [-0.31, -0.15]

Heterogeneity: Not applicable
Test for overall effect: Z = 5.85 (P < 0.00001)

## 1.1.3 Salmeterol

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Study or Subgroup</th>
<th>Mean Difference</th>
<th>SE</th>
<th>Weight</th>
<th>Mean Difference IV, Random, 95% CI</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Brusasco 2003</td>
<td>-0.16</td>
<td>0.0654</td>
<td>100.0%</td>
<td>-0.16 [-0.29, -0.03]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Subtotal (95% CI) 100.0% -0.16 [-0.29, -0.03]

Heterogeneity: Not applicable
Test for overall effect: Z = 2.45 (P = 0.01)