Dear Josef

Subject: Manuscript revision, entitled “Incidence of first ever stroke during Hajj ceremony”

Thanks for your valuable review for our submitted paper. We have applied the requested changes on the second revision. Please find below our responses to these concerns point by point.

Major concerns
To compare incidence between two populations you need to adjust the crude incidences to a standard population. Please, do it to Iran and World population all over the manuscript. So, in table 2, you reported a crude rate of 18 (10-26) in Hajj subjects and 12 (5-19) in MSIS subjects (p=0.273). You need to calculated and show the 95% CI in adjusted rates in both populations and then the p value. Please note that your conclusion of lower incidence in the Hajj cohort is not reliable yet. For age and genders subgroups, the comparisons need to be done only after adjustment. Do not calculate p value between crude rates from different populations. Please, fix these concerns all over the manuscript. An incidence rate is ratio between number of cases (numerator) and population at risk (denominator). So, please insert “n” column before population in the tables 2 and 3.

Authors’ response: the changes are now applied following the recommendation

Minor concerns
Abstract: Background...incidence of first ever stroke; Next line: ... first ever stroke In stroke epidemiology, CVST are not included with ischemic strokes. The anatomy, physiopathology, risk factors and prognosis are completely diverse. The indication or not of oral contraceptive are not related to your methods. As I told before , please, exclude the CVST cases:

Authors’ response: Although, some epidemiological studies of stroke do not include cerebral vein thrombosis; ischemic stroke and cerebral vein thrombosis are important types of stroke and comply with the clinical definition of stroke. As per the most recent consensus definition the American Heart Association/American Stroke Association (AHA/ASA), we included these two cerebral venous thrombosis (CVT) as stroke because they had infarction or hemorrhage in localized area of brain because of thrombosis of a cerebral venous structure. lease refer to the new guideline of stroke: Sacco RL, Kasner SE, Broderick JP, Caplan LR, Connors JJ, Culebras

Please also note that we have added our new statistician as a co-author who was fundamental in revising the statistical analyses to apply the requested changes, and the revision to the result and interpretation.

We wish to thank the reviewer and editorial board again for taking the time to review the manuscript. It is only through thoughtful and constructive criticism that the quality of this manuscript has been improved. If you have any questions or concerns, please feel free to contact me at the address below.

Sincerely,

Amir Azarpazhooh, DDS, MSc, PhD, FRCD(C)
Assistant Professor, Disciplines of Dental Public Health and Endodontics, Faculty of Dentistry, University of Toronto
Assistant Professor, Clinical Epidemiology Program, Institute of Health Policy, Management and Evaluation, Faculty of Medicine, University of Toronto
Investigator, Toronto Health Economics and Technology Assessment Collaborative, University of Toronto
Dental Research Institute, Faculty of Dentistry, University of Toronto