Papers submitted to the Journal must be clear, original, strongly related to the subject, concise, complete, with precise logic, and honestly appraised.

**Paper No.:**

**Reviewer:** N. Komninos

**Date:** 1 October 2011

**Title:** Smart City Initiative: A Case Study of Barcelona

---

### PAPER PROFILE

Please indicate X in the boxes which, in your opinion, best describe the following features of the manuscript.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Feature</th>
<th>Poor*</th>
<th>Marginal*</th>
<th>Acceptable</th>
<th>Good</th>
<th>Honours*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Originality of the work</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>+</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scholarly relevance</td>
<td>+</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional/industrial relevance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>+</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Completeness of the work</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>+</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgement of the work of others by references</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>+</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organization of the manuscript</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>+</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clarity in writing, tables, graphs and illustrations</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>+</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Likelihood of passing the ‘test of time’</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

In your opinion, is the research methodology and treatment of the subject in the paper plausible and free of technical errors?

Have you checked any equations or mathematical treatments (if applicable)?

Are you aware of prior publication or presentation of this work?

Is the manuscript free of commercialism?

Is the paper too long?*

---

### RECOMMENDATION

This paper is: (check only one place)

- Honours quality*
- Acceptable
- Acceptable with minor revisions*
- Acceptable with major revisions* (review required after revision)
- NOT ACCEPTABLE

* Please justify on next page

---

Reviewers Signature (if posted):
PLEASE COMPLETE THIS REVIEW FORM AND KEEP A COPY FOR YOUR RECORDS

COMMENTS
To assist the author(s) in revising his/her/their manuscript, please separate your remarks into two sections:

(1) Suggestions which would improve the quality of the paper but are not essential for publication

Some suggestions for the title of the paper:
- "A Smart City Initiative: The case of Barcelona"
- "A Smart City Initiative: Barcelona case study"
- "Smart City Barcelona: A case study"
- "Smart City Barcelona"

The Abstract should be improved, please see some comments

Information and Communication Technology is changing the way in which cities approach policy making and urban growth. Smart Cities base their strategies on employment of information and communication technologies in several fields such as economy, environment, mobility and governance to transform their city. This research draws on Barcelona as a city to analyze their transformation into a Smart city from a traditional model of municipality. It analyses Barcelona’s transformation on dimensions of management of this initiative, drivers, bottlenecks, conditions and assets. This case study concludes that Barcelona has effectively transformed to be a Smart City.

The second paragraph of section 2.Objectives (The present article is structured as following. First we ....... the case study analysis) describing the structure of the paper should be placed into the Abstract.

(2) Changes which must be made before publication

1. Introduction
The estimation that "Today, the world’s population that lives in urban areas was 50% of the world’s population by 2007 (UN, 2008)" (page 1, paragraph 1) is not accurate. See below the UN figures
2. Objectives

There is no need to have a section for the objectives. This might be part of the Introduction.

3. Literature review

The section does not correspond to a literature review. It is only about the meaning of the term "smart city."

The reference to Florida (2002) seems not accurate. Would you please provide the page in which Florida writes about smart cities.

The literature review should focus on the subject of the paper, "Smart City Barcelona" and other publications or reports related to the city of Barcelona and its strategy for becoming a smart city.

4. Methodology

In fact this section is about the sources of information than the methodology of the survey.

The sections 1-4 with the necessary improvements might stand as a good introduction.

5. Business case description

This is the main section of the paper and should be further elaborated.

In the beginning, it would be useful to give a brief account how Barcelona stated being interested on smart city strategies; a short of recent history introduction.

The smart city model is a good section, and the three pillars described in page 7 (ubiquitous infrastructures, information and human capital) should be part of the model description.

A more detailed description would be needed of the main components of the smart city strategy in Barcelona:
-Infrastructures
-Smart districts
-Living Labs initiatives
-Open data
-e-Services

Any quantitative measurement on the results and impact of smart city projects and initiatives would be very useful to have it in this section.

6. Conclusions

It is correct to write about a smart city strategy in Barcelona than Smart City Barcelona.

Please define a number of issues which you would wish addressing in the conclusions, i.e., how effective the smart city strategy has been; what are the lessons learnt; future steps, etc.

References
in the text and at the end should follow the Journal's format, as below:

Reference list guide
- The list of references should only include works that are cited in the text and that have been published or accepted for publication. Personal communications and unpublished works should only be mentioned in the text.
- Reference list entries should be alphabetized by the last names of the first author of each work, using brackets [1], [2], [3], etc.
- Numbers in brackets at the end of the paper correspond to the number of reference in the text, i.e. Etzkowitz and Leydesdorff [8] proposed the model of a Triple Helix of university–industry–government relations for explaining structural developments in knowledge-based economies.
- Different syntax of references is needed per category of publication, article, book, etc.

**Journal article:** Author(s) name (family + fist name initial) - Date - Title - Name of Journal - Vol. (issue) - Pages.

**Book:** Author's name - Date - Title - Publisher - Place

**Book chapter:** Author's name - Date - Title of article - Name of Editor - Title of Book - Pages - Publisher - Place, Pages.

**Online document:** Author's name - Date - Title - Resource Institution - Url - Date